

1 Vaughn R Walker
2 ADR/Law Office of Vaughn R Walker
3 Four Embarcadero Center, Suite 2200
4 San Francisco, CA 94111
5 Tel: (415) 871-2888
6 vrw@judgewalker.com

7
8 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9

10 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
11 OAKLAND DIVISION

12 IN RE CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT) ANTITRUST
13 LITIGATION

Master Case No 4:07-cv-05944-JST

14 This Relates to:
15 ALL DIRECT PURCHASER ACTIONS
16 ALL INDIRECT PURCHASER ACTIONS

MDL No 1917

**ORDER APPROVING
SPECIAL MASTER'S REPORT &
RECOMMENDATION ON YAN
DOCUMENT DISPUTE**

17
18
19 By letter dated February 17, 2023, Defendants, Irico Display Devices Co, Ltd and
20 Irico Group Corporation (collectively "Irico") and the Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs and Indirect
21 Purchaser Plaintiffs (collectively, "Plaintiffs"), have jointly agreed to seek the undersigned's
22 assistance in resolving a discovery dispute regarding whether a specific document in Irico's
23 possession (the "Yan Document") is responsive to Plaintiffs' discovery requests. 2/17/23
24 Taladay Letter. Irico has submitted the parties' correspondence on this issue and the disputed
25 document for *in camera* review by the undersigned. *Id.* Specifically, the parties request a
26 determination (1) whether the Yan Document is responsive to Plaintiffs' discovery requests;
27 and (2) if so, whether the Yan Document is privileged and should be included on a privilege log.

1 The undersigned issues this discovery report and recommendation pursuant to the court's
2 appointments. *See* ECF 5301, 6107.

3 Having reviewed the Yan Document, Plaintiffs' discovery requests and the
4 related submissions, the undersigned finds that the Yan Document is responsive to Direct
5 Purchaser Plaintiffs' Second Set of Requests for Production of Documents, Requests 37 and 39.
6 *See* Ex F to 2/17/23 Taladay Letter. The Yan Document relates to and was prepared for Irico "as
7 a result of any investigation or research conducted either internally or by an outside entity with
8 respect to price fixing, price manipulation or manipulation of production or capacity of CRT or
9 CRT Products," as specified by Request No 37. The Yan Document specifically refers to and
10 relates to an outside entity's investigation. The Yan Document also "refer[s] to or relat[es] to
11 plaintiffs in this litigation," as specified by Request No 39. Hence, the Yan Document is
12 responsive to Plaintiffs' discovery requests.

13 The information submitted for *in camera* review suggests, but is insufficient to
14 determine whether the Yan Document is privileged. To the extent Irico asserts a privilege, the
15 undersigned concludes that the Yan Document should be included on a privilege log forthwith,
16 in light of the scheduled deposition of Mr Yan during the week of March 13, 2023.

17
18 Date: February 18th, 2023



19 Vaughn R Walker

20 United States District Judge (Ret)

21
22 The Recommended Order of the Special Master is Accepted and Ordered / ~~Denied~~ / ~~Modified~~.

23 Date: March 7, 2023



24 Honorable Jon S Tigar
25 United States District Judge
26
27
28